



ANALYSIS OF PROPOSED TRANSIT SERVICE AND FARE CHANGES

STAFF REPORT

August 20, 2014

By

Kwaku Agyemang-Duah

1.0 INTRODUCTION

Since October 2010, Annapolis Transit has gone through many changes, some major and others minor. Below is a timeline of Annapolis Transit changes since 2010.

2010

- Replaced the pulse system with the current arterial system
- Reduced service -eliminated C60 to Arundel Mills and BWI and Navy Blue (a downtown shuttle)

2011

- Increased fare from \$1.00 to \$1.50
- Introduced Circulator which has almost identical route as the previous Navy Blue downtown shuttle

2012

- Increased fare from \$1.50 to \$2.00 (current fare)
- Gold Route - increased span and frequency of service. Service end times increased by 3 hours, from 8:00PM to 11:00PM; addition of one (1) bus to reduce wait times from 2 hours to 1 hour
- Brown Route - Increased frequency of service by adding 2 buses during the AM and PM peak periods

2013

- Brown Route - increased weekday service frequency by adding one (1) bus all day to reduce wait time from 45 minutes to 30 minutes. This replaced the Brown Route change in 2012
- Reduced span of service on Saturday on Yellow, Brown, Green, Red and Circulator routes through the delay of service start times:
 - ♦ Yellow: from 6:00AM to 7:30AM
 - ♦ Brown: from 5:45AM to 7:15AM

- ◆ Green and Green: from 5:30AM to 7:30AM
- ◆ Circulator: from 6:30AM to 8:00AM

2014 (Proposed)

Option 1 - A Mix of Service Reduction and Fare Increase on Selected Routes:

- Reduce service hours on the Gold and Circulator routes
- Reduce frequency of service on the Gold, Circulator and Brown routes
- Reduce route length on the Circulator route
- Charge base one-way fare of \$1.00 on the Circulator route
- Increase base one-way fare on the Gold and Yellow routes from \$2.00 to \$3.00
- Reduce bus service on holidays

Option 2 - Routes Elimination

- Eliminate Gold, Yellow and Circulator routes

While some of these changes have led to improved service reliability and efficiency such as changes in the route structure, others have the potential of leading the transit system into a "death spiral" in which fare increases and service reductions lower ridership, which could lead to further fare increases and service reductions, etc. For instance total unlinked passenger trips in FY 2011 were 1,047,822 compared to 728,507 in FY 2013.

The "ups and downs" in the provision of transit services has the potential of creating uncertainty about the future of Annapolis Transit System for both transit employees and riders, especially for those who depend on it. In view of the many transit changes within and/or from one administration to the other, perhaps, a more important question for the city is "how much transit services the city needs and can sustain as part of improving mobility and accessibility for all who visit, work and/or live in the Annapolis area?"

2.0 PROPOSED 2014 TRANSIT CHANGES

The proposed transit changes are a mix of fare increases, service reduction and routes elimination. A summary of fare increase and service reductions are found in Table 1. The Transportation Department hopes that these analyses together with the public inputs will help make much more informed decisions.

2.1 Overview of Affected Routes

Circulator

This is a downtown shuttle that was introduced in the summer of 2011. The purpose of this downtown shuttle service is to leverage existing transportation and parking resources to move people who park at the City's three participating garages quickly and efficiently to their destinations in the downtown area. Current service frequency is every 10 minutes with two (2) buses. In FY2013, this route carried almost 160,000 riders and cost about \$850,000 to operate. No fare is charged on the Circulator.

TABLE 1. PROPOSED SERVICE & FARE CHANGES

	CURRENT	PROPOSED
GOLD ROUTE		
No. of buses	2	1
Span of service	Mon-Fri, 6:00 am to 11:15 pm Saturday, Sunday: 8:00 am to 8:00 PM	Mon-Fri, 5:30 am to 8:00 pm Saturday, Sunday: 8:00 am to 8:00 PM
Frequency of Service	Every 60 minutes	Every 45 minutes
Route	Sojourner Douglas College (Edgewater) to Anne Arundel Community College (15 miles)	Kmart (Edgewater) to Church Circle (10 miles)
Fare (one-way)	\$2	\$3
CIRCULATOR		
No. of buses	2	1
Span of service	Sunday-Thursday, 7:30 AM to 12:00 am Friday, Saturday: 7:30 AM to 2:30 AM	Monday-Saturday, 7:30 AM to 11:00 PM Sunday: 8:00 AM to 8:00 PM
Frequency of Service	Every 10 minutes	Every 15 minutes
Route	Park Place to City Dock (1.3 miles)	Park Place to Church Circle (0.9 miles)
Fare (one-way)	\$0	\$1
BROWN		
No. of buses	3	2
Span of service	Monday-Friday: 5:45 AM to 8:00 PM Saturday: 7:15 AM to 8:00 PM	Monday-Friday: 5:45 AM to 8:00 PM Saturday: 7:15 AM to 8:00 PM
Frequency of Service	30 minutes	45 minutes
Route	Westfield Mall to Eastport Plaza (10 miles)	Westfield Mall to Eastport Plaza (10 miles)
Fare (one-way)	\$2	\$2
YELLOW		
Route	Westfield Mall via Housely & Riva roads (3.5 miles)	Westfield Mall via Housely & Riva roads (3.5 miles)
Fare (one-way)	\$2	\$3

The shuttle service was to be funded through an increase in the parking fee particularly at the participating city garages. Although the parking fee was increased, the money was not dedicated for the Circulator service.

Gold Route

The Gold Route currently connects two (2) community colleges in the service area, Sojourner Douglas College in the south (Edgewater) and Anne Arundel Community College (AACC) in the north (Arnold), a distance of about 15 miles. Currently, there are two (2) buses on this route with a service frequency of 60 minutes. In FY2013, there were 47,075 riders which brought in fare revenue of \$49,557. Direct operating cost in the same fiscal year was about \$524,000. Before FY2013, there was only one (1) bus on this route with a service frequency of two (2) hours.

Brown Route

This route is about 10 miles long (one-way). Ridership on this route in FY2013 was just over 114,000 passengers. Total fare revenue and operating cost in the same fiscal year were about \$130,000 and \$578,000 respectively.

Yellow Route

The Yellow route serves the public transportation needs in the Riva Road corridor, connecting the Annapolis Mall to the Claiborne Housing Community. With only one (1) bus, round trip travel time is about 30 minutes and one-way route length is about 3.5 miles. Most of the trips on this route are transferred trips from other routes. The route is mainly used by city citizens to access services in the county and Annapolis High School Students.

In FY 2013, the route carried about 29,000 passengers and brought in about \$20,000 in total fare revenue. Direct operating cost in the same fiscal year (2013) was about \$224,000. No service changes are being proposed apart from a proposed fare increase from \$2.00 to \$3.00.

2.2 Proposed Fare Increases on Selected Routes

The proposed fare increase will affect three (3) routes – Circulator, Gold and Yellow. A 100 % increase in fare (from \$0 to \$1 is being proposed for the Circulator. Both Gold and Yellow routes will see a fare hike of 50% if the proposal is approved.

The proposed fare increase on Gold and Yellow routes from the current \$2.00 to \$3.00, a 50% increase, seems to be based on the geographic location of these two routes and not necessarily an introduction of zone- or distanced-based fare system.

A review of one-way bus fares of other transit systems in Maryland seems to suggest that the current one-way fare of \$2.00 is comparatively higher than other systems such as Maryland Transit Administration (MTA) (\$1.60 for local bus, metro subway or light rail); WMATA (\$1.75) and Montgomery (Maryland) Ride On system (\$1.75). The \$4.00 all-day pass for Annapolis Transit is even more expensive than MTA's \$3.50 all-day pass for unlimited travel on local bus, metro subway, light rail and neighborhood shuttle in the Baltimore region, a much bigger geographic entity.

Currently, the Gold has the longest one-way trip length, (about 15 miles) followed by the Brown (10 miles), Red and Yellow (7 miles each) Purple (6 miles) Green (5 miles).

There are two basic ways of charging cash fare for public transit service: by distance traveled or by a flat fare. Currently, Annapolis Transit charges a one-way, flat fare of \$2.00 irrespective of the distance traveled for the following reasons:

1. It is easy to understand and collect.
2. Fare evasion, both intentional and unintentional, is lowered as passengers need not worry about paying for the correct number of sections or zones.
3. A flat fare is also faster to collect on the bus, as no additional time is needed to calculate the correct fare and punch any fare receipt correctly. This improves the on-time performance of the buses

The main disadvantage of a flat fare from a passenger perspective is that flat fare penalizes transit patrons who are only traveling a short distance. But since Annapolis Transit encourages riders to get, and riders do use all-day pass for unlimited rides on any route, this disadvantage is greatly minimized.

2.3 Proposed Service Reductions

Almost all the proposed service adjustments will revert back to the original service plan implemented in 2010. Although the 2010 Plan calls for service enhancements such as the addition of one (1) bus to the Brown Route as was implemented in 2013, such enhancements were contingent upon the availability of additional funding. This was, however, not the case - there were no additional funds and yet the enhancements were implemented. This resulted in significant increase in operating costs while revenues were almost flat. The affected routes are Gold, Circulator and Brown.

Circulator

As summarized in Table 1, the proposed service change will cut down the number of buses from two (2) to one (1), reduce the route length and increase wait times for riders. These proposed services changes are in addition to a proposal to charge a fare of \$1.00 as discussed previously.

Gold

The proposed change in route length will mean that students who are heading towards the Anne Arundel Community College will have to transfer to MTA 14 bus which stops at the community college. This will require the creation of a new schedule to minimize wait times to transfer to MTA bus. Currently, any transfer from Annapolis Transit bus to MTA bus is at no extra cost. The reduction in route length will also mean reduction in travel time.

Brown

The proposed service reduction through the elimination of one bus means that two buses will be on this route. There is no change in route structure but the service frequency will increase from about 30 minutes to about 45 minutes.

2.4 Proposed Changes in Holiday Schedule

Based on the analysis of ridership, revenue miles and cost data, the current holiday schedule is not cost effective. To reduce cost, the following changes to holiday schedule as summarized in Table 2 are being proposed. This proposal has potential cost savings of about \$26,000.

2.5 Proposed Routes Elimination:

This proposal will eliminate three bus routes – Gold, Circulator and Yellow. With the elimination of these three (3) routes, the footprint of the fixed route system will be reduced significantly. The proposed route cuts will constitute approximately 30% reduction in weekly transit service hours. This is significant and will negatively impact the transit dependent population in the city who uses these routes for their transportation needs.

Table 2 Proposed Holiday Schedule

2013 Holiday	Current	Proposed
New Year Day	Gold, Circulator, Purple, Paratransit	Closed
Martin Luther King Jr	Regular schedule	Sunday Schedule
President's day	Regular schedule	Sunday Schedule
Maryland Day	Regular schedule	Regular schedule
Good Friday	Regular schedule	Sunday schedule, State Shuttle
Memorial Day	Gold, Purple, Circulator, Paratransit	Sunday Schedule
Independence Day	Gold, Purple, Circulator, Paratransit	Shuttle service from 4:00 pm -12:00 am
Labor day	Gold, Purple, Circulator, Paratransit	Sunday schedule
Veterans' day	Gold, Purple, Circulator, Paratransit	Sunday schedule
Thanksgiving	Gold, Circulator, Purple, Paratransit	Closed
Day after thanksgiving	Regular schedule	Sunday schedule
Christmas eve	Regular schedule	Regular schedule, no evening Purple
Christmas	Closed	Closed
New Year's eve	Regular schedule	Regular schedule, no evening Purple, Shuttle service from 4:00 pm - 1:00 am

3.0 POTENTIAL COST SAVINGS

Tables 3a and 3b summarize the potential direct cost savings from service reduction or elimination of the Gold, Circulator and Yellow. The potential cost savings from service reductions on the Gold, Circulator and Brown routes could be \$878,308. Eliminating three (3) routes – Gold, Circulator and Yellow - could result in direct cost savings of about \$1,596,050.

Table 3a. Potential Direct Cost Savings from Service Reduction

Route	FY2013 Actual Direct Cost		Potential Cost Savings	
	No of buses	FY2013 Cost	No. of buses	Amount
Gold	2	523,570	1	261,785
Circulator	2	847,686	1	423,843
Brown	3	578,040	2	192,680
Total	7	1,949,296	4	878,308

Table 3b. Potential Direct Cost Savings from Eliminating 3 Routes

Route	FY2013 Actual Direct Cost		Potential Cost Savings	
	No of buses	FY2013 Cost	No. of buses	Amount
Gold	2	523,570	0	523,570
Circulator	2	847,686	0	847,686
Yellow	1	224,794	0	224,794
Total	5	1,596,050	0	1,596,050

4.0 POTENTIAL IMPACTS

This section focuses on analyses of potential impacts of the proposed changes in five areas. These are transit ridership, mobility and access impacts, economic impacts, safety and security impacts and social equity impacts. Due to lack of data and shortage of staff, a more detailed quantitative analysis of all these five impact areas could not be done.

4.1 Reduced Ridership

Fare increase and/or service cuts could cause a precipitous reduction ridership (see Table 4). Using fare elasticity values published by the American Public Transportation Association (APTA), a one (1) percent increase in bus fare will cause a 0.43 percent reduction in ridership so a 100% increase in fare (from \$0 to \$1) could cause ridership to decline by about 43%. The reduction could be significant where the route is short and the service area is compact as is the case of the Circulator route. This means that the

proposed fare increase alone on the Circulator route could lead to at least 43% reduction in ridership

For a service reduction (e.g. taking one bus off the route), some empirical studies have shown that where the route is short and the service area is compact, 15% service cut resulted in a 19% ridership decline. This could mean be that the proposed 50% service reduction alone could reduce ridership by at about 63% ($50/15*19$)

Cumulative effect of both fare increase and service reduction could be as much as 79% reduction in ridership: $(1-0.43\{\text{fare increase}\})*(1-0.63\{\text{service reduction}\}) = 0.2109 - 1 = -0.7891*100$ [expressed as a percentage] = -78.91%

Based on APTA's published bus fare elasticity of -0.43, the proposed 50% fare increase on the Gold and Yellow routes could reduce ridership by about 22% on each route.

Table 4. Estimated Potential Impacts of Fare Increase and Service Reduction on Ridership

Route	Fare Increase (%)	Service Reduction (%)	Cumulative Impact (%)
Circulator	-43	-63	-78.9
Gold	-22	-63	-71.1
Yellow	-22	N/A	-22.0
Brown	N/A	-41	-41.0

4.2 Mobility and Access Impacts

Transit service cuts result in a smaller transit footprint and could lead to hardships for transit-dependent riders who reverse commute. Reduced transit footprint also affects ADA complementary paratransit service which is provided within three-quarter-mile area around fixed routes. The shrinking footprint of the fixed route network will mean large areas will lose access to ADA paratransit services. This could be particularly true in the case of the proposed elimination of the Gold and Yellow routes.

Recently, the Department conducted an origin-destination survey on the Gold and Yellow routes. An analysis of the data shows that a large portion of the people live in zip code 21401 and the two main trip purposes were schools and jobs. Eliminating these routes will potentially bring increased hardships to these individuals. In the end, many may be compelled to own automobiles, thereby increasing traffic congestion and mobile sources of emission with associated negative effects on the environment including all of the inlets within the boundaries of the City of Annapolis, the Severn River and the Chesapeake Bay.

Transit service cuts also decrease the convenience of transit services due to geographic changes, route restructuring, and decreases in frequency. Riders on the Brown Route will experience longer travel times due to the proposed elimination of one bus.

Some riders, especially students to the AACC will have to make transfers where they previously had a direct trip as is the case in the proposed restructuring for the Gold route. Not only will the students have to make transfers to MTA 14 bus, they could be late to, or miss classes because of the unreliability of the MTA 14 bus. Sometimes, this bus gets out of service in Annapolis, meaning that those who are waiting for the bus to go to classes will be forced to get alternative transportation or miss classes. The MTA 14 bus schedules shows that sometimes, this bus do not go to the college at all.

Private transportation alternatives generally provided lower quality service and charged riders significantly higher fares. Private operators that implement new services to replace transit routes usually cut service spans, frequencies, or the number of trips in comparison with the previous transit route, thereby rendering the service much less convenient for riders. When private operators have not achieved ridership expectations, they end the service and some even go out of business. Taxis provide convenient service, but are too expensive for most riders to use as everyday transportation.

Any proposal for the city dock that will eliminate parking spaces and the impending closure of Hillman Parking garage for a replacement will result in severe parking space shortage. This will require people to park at other garages such as Park Place and Gotts and transportation to their final destinations in the downtown core.

The increased number of cars on the road whether from ridesharing or single occupancy vehicles whose occupants previously used transit could contribute to traffic and congestion problems.

4.3 Economic and Financial Impacts

Residents may not have access to jobs because of the proposed service cuts. This may be true with the proposed elimination of the Gold and Yellow routes especially where residents have no other affordable and reliable form of transportation.

Both the Gold and Yellow are considered to be Job Access and Reverse Commute. Although the City receives small amount of subsidy from Anne Arundel County Government through the Department of Social Services and Office of Planning & Zoning, the inability to access jobs in other parts of the county seems more important than perhaps the potential loss of this subsidy.

The increase in cars on the road could raise congestion costs including time delays and fuel use, and contributed to pollution and health concerns. Congestion costs affect individuals, both drivers who used to take transit and those who have always commuted by car.

Cost shifting may occur in various forms. Costs may shift to providing paratransit complementary service for riders who previously used fixed routes.

When transit-dependent riders and transit agency employees lost their jobs, the local economy could suffer a "ripple effect" from decreased spending as salaries, wages, and benefits associated with the jobs may be lost.

Complete elimination of the Circulator or even making it seasonal may have impact on parking revenues, especially at Park Place as well as other garages and lots. Much of the working public that utilizes the Circulator has gotten used to being able to park away from Downtown and ride in on the Circulator.

While the Circulator may be a non-revenue service, in the bigger picture of the parking program the Circulator raises the revenue at Park Place and the other garages.

Consider the following:

- Revenues at Park Place will go down in regards to general parking traffic
- Revenues at Park Place will also go down because of lost programs such as the juror program, the Watermark Tours program and the hospitality program. All of these programs work to increase revenue at Park Place as well as keep those parkers off of Downtown streets
- Revenues at Park Place have been on a steady increase. This increase will cease.
- Revenues at all garages will go down. These lost revenues will not necessarily transfer to on street parking because that is based on availability of spaces.

4.4 Safety and Security Impacts

Transit users who must now walk longer distance to the nearest transit stop (where a local bus service was previously available) may be exposed to dangers to their safety. The proposed elimination of the Circulator will mean that people who work in the downtown core and park at Park Place will walk a longer distance and may face these dangers.

4.5 Social Equity Impacts

The most vulnerable populations in a community including the elderly, people with disabilities, and low-income residents may be left with few transportation alternatives. Without public transportation, these transit dependent people could lose their independence including access to jobs and medical services.

Eliminating the Gold Route will disproportionately and significantly affect the disabled population in Annapolis who use this route to access services at Arundel Lodge. Specifically, the hearing impaired the mute, the blind, the autistic and people with other disabilities who are learning how to live independently, including the ability to travel, will be severely affected. By being able to travel independently using the transit system, these people are being integrated into the mainstream society.

5.0 CHALLENGES

In addition to potential impacts discussed above, there are challenges that must be addressed regarding the implementation of any fare increase on the Gold and Yellow routes. For instance, are we charging riders the same fare irrespective of the length of their trip?

There are other challenges that must be addressed too - how do we deal with people with day passes that transfer say from the Red to Yellow – will they pay more or not? If they are to pay additional fare, how much, and how will the bus operators calculate and enforce this new fare structure?

These challenges introduce some degree of complexity that makes it hard to understand and collect the fare. In fact, most transit agencies with distance-based fares employ fare inspectors who make sure the correct zoned ticket is bought. In addition, the traditional way of charging distance-based fares - by means of concentric zones around the central business district - results in the charging of different fares for the same distance traveled based on whether the trip is radial or cross-town oriented.

6.0 RECOMMENDATIONS

ADOT recommendations for service and fare changes to the Annapolis Transit system are based on careful analyses of:

- potential impacts such as mobility and access impacts, safety and security impacts and social equity impacts;
- public comments;
- socio-economic characteristics of the transit-dependent population;
- federal regulations such as Title VI of the Civil Rights Act of 1964; and
- budgetary constraints.

It is the contention of ADOT that Annapolis Transit has been on a see-saw path for the past five years and it is time to “stabilize” it using the 2010 Annapolis Transit Development Plan as a road map. A “stabilized” transit system is attractive and reliable transit service which in turn creates public confidence and subsequent public participation, leading to increased ridership and revenue.

Equally important is the fact that public transportation service is a community service just like police services and fire protection services. These services are available to everybody in the community – residents, visitors and workers irrespective of one’s socio-economic status

Also, it is very critical for the city to rethink of the “enterprise” status of transit services. Unlike other city “enterprise activities such as water, sewage and parking, public transportation faces a very stiff competition from the dominant private vehicle ideology. In general, “enterprise” activities are supposed to break-even in terms of expenses vis-à-vis revenues. Public transportation systems in this country, whether small or large do not generate enough revenues to pay for all their expenses.

General Recommendations

It should be noted that significant transit service reduction to eliminate three routes based solely on budget analysis and to some extent geographic locations of two of these routes is a Title VI violation and puts the transit system in a death spiral. Cutting routes could

jeopardize grant funds. In other words there is the potential to lose more money in the long run than gain in the short run.

City residents need connections to jobs and medical services located in the County. Decreased frequency outside the city still permits access, albeit less frequently, and avoids the problems associated with complete elimination of these routes. Thus, ADOT **does not support the proposed elimination of the Gold, Yellow and Circulator routes.**

Specific Recommendations

Gold Route:

Route Structure: Keep the current route structure but reduce service with frequency by using only one bus as was originally proposed and implemented in the 2010 Annapolis Transit Development Plan. With this recommendation, the proposed headway will be two (2) hours instead of the current one (1) hour. Schedule adherence in downtown Annapolis and along MD Route 2 with a congested road network places a very heavy burden on MTA 14 bus while harming the very riders that need the service connecting County and City residents with their Community College.

Span of Service: Change the current span of service to the original one as proposed in the 2010 Transit Development Plan and implemented in the same year: Monday to Friday, 5:30 am to 8:00 pm; Saturday and Sunday – 8:00 am to 8:00 p.m.

Fare increase: ADOT recommends that the City **not increase** the fare on the Gold route in tandem with decreasing headways, span of service, and forcing a transfer that is very heavily reliant on a schedule that MTA would also need to meet. We also recommend regarding the GOLD route that more effort be placed on obtaining the Community College's support for the route by offering a subsidy in its operating costs. As noted earlier in this report, subsidies from Anne Arundel County Department of Social Services plus portion of MTA Large Urban funds all go to support this route. Those funds, while not huge are predicated on a level of service expectation. If that expectation is not met, the result is probably a further reduction in revenues to transit system.

ADOT also recommends that ARTMA be engaged to garner support to sustain this route. Anne Arundel County passes through funds to ARTMA to bolster rideshare and other non-auto oriented solutions to mobility.

Circulator

ADOT recommends that only **one (1) bus** is used on the Circulator route instead of the current two (2) buses. By reducing the layover time at Park Place, and curtailing the Circulator at Church Circle rather than going all the way to the Dock would maintain the 10 minute headway with one vehicle. Main Street is just two (2) blocks long; the standard walk to a bus stop is four (4) blocks. Having a bus stop at the top of Main Street still serves the City Dock. Furthermore, as it is a scenic straight shot from the Circle to

Dock, you would be able to see the City Dock from the bus stop. Circulator riders would then walk down Main Street, window shopping and spending money in the stores along the way, further encouraging economic vitality.

ADOT recommends that the current **free fare on the circulator should continue**. Funding for the circulator should come from increased parking rate at all garages, allowing for one stop payment for both parking and the shuttle service. The money set aside in the budget as a separate line item as was originally proposed in 2011. It should not be bundled with the city share of the transit operating cost.

Other specific recommendation is as follows:

Span of Service: Monday – Saturday, 7:30 am to 11:00 pm; and
 Sunday: 8:00 am to 8:00 p.m. as proposed

Certainly, there is some demand for the Circulator service after 11 p.m. on Friday and Saturday (see attached ridership count). However, the proposed end of service times will be consistent with the other fixed routes end times.

Brown Route

It is recommended that the number of buses be reduced from three (3) to two (2) per the 2010 Transit Development Plan. This will increase trip frequency to 45 minutes.

Yellow Route:

ADOT **does not support the proposed fare increase from \$2.00 to \$3.00** as it does not find any basis for such an increase apart from the location of the route. The Yellow Route serves a ridership population that tends to be low/moderate income and uses the route to access entry level jobs at the major employers in Parole such as Westfield and Anne Arundel Medical Center, plus the many businesses and offices located in the vicinity of those two large employment sites. These employers should be members of ARTMA, and as noted above, the City should reach out to ARTMA and ask it to support an effort to sustain the route at current service levels and cost.

Holiday Schedule

ADOT recommends the implementation of the proposed holiday schedule as in Table 2.

7.0 BUDGET FOR ADOT'S RECOMMENDATIONS

The total budget for ADOT's recommendations is about \$5,844,176 (Appendix 3) compared to the adopted FY 2015 budget of \$5,142,611. The Finance Department projects that cost of the current service plan (without any changes to the transit services) to be \$7,954,945 in FY 2015 (Appendix 3). This amount (\$7,954,945) is \$2,110,769 more than the estimated budget for the recommendations (\$7,954,945 - \$5,844,176). **In other words ADOT's recommendations will help reduce a projected budget deficit from \$2,812,334 (\$5,142,611 - \$7,954,945) to \$701,565 (\$5,142,611 - \$5,844,176) in FY 2015.**

APPENDICES

Appendix 1: Written Public Comments

Appendix 2: Ridership counts on Circulator

Appendix 3: Budget for ADOT's recommendations